DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 403 488 CE 073 507

TITLE	Diversity in the Workplace.
PUB DATE	96
NOTE	22p.; In: Academy of Human Resource Development (AHRD) Conference Proceedings (Minneapolis, MN, February 29-March 3, 1996); see CE 073 480.
PUB TYPE	Speeches/Conference Papers (150) -- Reports - Research/Technical (143) -- Viewpoints (Opinion/Position Papers, Essays, etc.) (120)
EDRS PRICE	MF01/PC01 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS	Access to Education; Adult Education; Career Development; *Diversity (Institutional); Educational Opportunities; Employed Women; *Equal Opportunities (Jobs); Foreign Countries; Labor Force Development; *Leadership Styles; Leadership Training; Management Development; Organizational Climate; Police; *Racial Relations; *Sex Fairness; *Work Environment
IDENTIFIERS	African Americans; Great Britain

ABSTRACT

This document contains three papers presented at a symposium on diversity in the workplace moderated by Sandra Johnson at the 1996 conference of the Academy of Human Resource Development (AHRD). "Diversity and Development: An Assessment of Equal Opportunities and the Role of HRD in the Police Service" (Rashmi Biswas, Penny Dick) examines aspects of the relationship between organizational culture and human resources management through a study of a large British police constabulary. It explores difficulties that organizations with an exclusionary culture face when trying to implement equal opportunity policies. "Leadership Development in Multiracial Organizations" (Larry G. Martin) uses a multiple-perspective case analysis approach to provide an in-depth analysis of a leader's actions to address diversity problems within a multiracial organization and to identify the extent to which that leader used a multiframe approach to leadership. "HRD Initiatives Contributing to Women's Career Progress" (Kimberly S. McDonald, Linda M. Hite) presents the findings of an exploratory study examining factors that influence women's access to management development and discusses how four major human resource development (HRD) initiatives (training, career development, mentoring, and overseas assignments) may assist women's advancement. Papers contain references. (MN)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

ED 403 488

SYMPOSIUM
[26] DIVERSITY IN THE WORKPLACE

Chair: Sandra Johnson, Personnel Decisions, Inc.

An Assessment of Equal Opportunities and the Role of HRD in the Police Service
Rashmi Biswas, Sheffield Hallam University
Penny Dick, University of Teesside

Leadership Development in Multiracial Organizations
Larry G. Martin, University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee

HRD Initiatives Contributing to Women's Career Progress
Kimberly S. McDonald, Indiana-Purdue University Fort Wayne
Linda M. Hite, Indiana-Purdue University Fort Wayne

Academy of Human Resource Development
1996 Conference
Minneapolis, MN
February 29-March 3, 1996

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.

Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE AND DISSEMINATE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

R Biswas L Martin
K McDonald

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

CE 073 507

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Diversity and Development: An Assessment of Equal Opportunities and the Role of HRD in the Police Service

Rashmi Biswas
Sheffield Hallam University

Penny Dick
University of Teesside

This paper examines aspects of the relationship between organizational culture and HRM focusing upon the major finding that a powerful organizational culture reinforced by HRM practices such as employee development, can in fact create an exclusionary culture. The research, conducted within a large British Police Constabulary, explores some of the difficulties facing an organization with an exclusionary culture, when trying to implement equal opportunities policies.

The development of HRM has encouraged organizations to treat its employees as it would any other resource. Consequently in order to maximise the output from this human resource the practise of human resource management advocates the exploiting of the employees in order to secure maximum benefit to the organization and indeed improve organizational effectiveness. Academics are often swift to point out that such "exploiting" of employees is a neutral process and should not have any negative consequences for the employees. In theory the intention is that an employee is exploited only by virtue of their own potential, and that an organization merely wishes to allow all of its staff to perform at the highest possible standard. This requires investments in HRM practices such as performance management, recruitment and selection, rewards, and employee development. This approach may appear to benefit both the employee and the organization but unfortunately the notion of "exploiting" employees is not necessarily compatible with the promotion of equal opportunities or the management of diversity. Furthermore, as Legge (1989) points out, the problems associated with organizational fit offer little progression towards equality in the workplace.

This paper examines the fascinating area of the police service, and explores aspects of the organizational culture within the constabulary under investigation. Links are made between the organizational culture, the existence of an exclusionary culture, the management of diversity and the influence of an overall HRM strategy incorporating employee development which although attempting to manage employees to superior levels of performance may in fact unwittingly (or indeed wittingly) restrict the activities and contributions made by some of its members.

Interest for this research stemmed from the mutual interest shared by the authors around the existence of a dominant or exclusionary organizational culture. Of particular interest was the intervention of equal opportunities policies and their attempt to overcome inequities within organizations. Clearly many organizations claim to be equal opportunities employers, yet discrimination is widespread and imbalances prevail. Why is it then that equal opportunities policies do not work.

The Police Service

Police work is a diverse area for research as it involves a range of behaviours and demands a variety of skills from the officers such as physical courage, strength and fitness, combined with diplomacy, compassion, sensitivity and discipline. Research has been conducted within police services in the UK, Australia and the USA examining issues such as stress, and the quality of working life. The police service has long been a bastion of male dominance - purely in numerical terms if nothing else. When women

© copyright, Biswas and Dick, 1996

began to infiltrate the ranks of the police force they were treated with scepticism as to their suitability to perform an essentially "male" task. Indeed in the UK when women first joined the service they were placed in a specialised department known as the Womens' Unit. Today however, it is much more commonplace to find women entering the profession and in fact the police service in the UK recieves many applications from women in the who are attracted to the police service and can see a structured career before them. What is problematic for the police service in the UK is the poor progression of women and very seriously the retention problem which appears to affect female officers much more dramatically than male officers.

The County Constabulary

The constabulary under investigation covers seven divisions, and serves one of the largest counties in the country. At the time of the research the constabulary employed approximately 1,500 officers and civilians, only 150 of whom were female.

The organization functions through both mainstream operations and specialist departments. The specialist departments include: criminal investigation department (CID), traffic, special branch, drugs squad, family protection unit (FPU), community affairs/crime prevention, training, process, task force, under water search and dogs section. It is useful to note the gender distribution by department as this apparently inequitable gendered division of labour is of concern to the County Constabulary:

Percentage of Female Officers by Specialist Department

Traffic	*3*
CID	*5*
Special Branch	*20*
Drugs Squad	*20*
FPU	*87*
CA/CP	*29*
Process	*20*
Training	*15*
Task Force	*4*
Under water	*0*
Dogs	*5*

Such gender divisions within these specialist departments provided an opportunity for deeper analysis into the sexual division of labour in the constabulary and gave insight into the gender processes. Two of these specialist departments therefore were chosen for research specifically because of the gender imbalances within them, namely CID and FPU. This is explained in more detail in the methodology section of this paper.

The County Constabulary not only displayed evidence of horizontal gender segregation but also clear gender divisions were apparent vertically within the organization. This is shown below:

Percentage of Female Officers by Rank

Chief Superintendent	*0*
Superintendent	*6*
Chief Inspector	*0*
Inspector	*4*
Sergeant	*3*
PC	*13*

It is important, however, to consider these percentages as actual numbers too as the under representation of women within the constabulary overall somewhat distorts the figures. For example in the table above the percentage of female superintendents is shown as 6%, this translates inreality to only one woman who

holds this rank.

Equal Opportunities Policy County Constabulary is attempting to implementand pursue an equal opportunities policy. The results of an equal opportunities survey conducted within the force in 1993 posed two important questions:

1. Why do such a low number of female officers put themselves forward for promotion examinations?
2. Do female officers have equal opportunities to work in specialist posts?

Like many other organizations the police service recognises its own shortcomings in the area of equal opportunities but is unclear about how to specifically address the problems this situation presents. In other words, why is the equal opportunities policy inadequate and ineffective when the intentions are genuine? Why is the retention of female officers so poor? (The average length of service for a female officer is six years, compared to twenty six years for male officer.)

Methodology

The empirical research for this study employed qualitative techniques which can be divided into four stages. The first stage involved the use of repertory grid technique, the second stage built upon the data from the repertory grids and resulted in the administering of four different questionnaires, in the third stage interviews were conducted with a sample of female police officers, and finally the fourth stage consisted of analysisng the appraisal forms of both male and female police officers.

Repertory Grid Technique The immediate research challenge was to identify the organizational culture at County Constabulary. The reason for this was to explore our pre-research "hunch" (Dalton, 1964) that the police service had developed an exclusionary culture. In other words we considered it likely that the long standing history of males in within the police had contributed to the development of an organizational culture which somehow excluded women and possibly some men, who found themselves operating outside the dominant culture and therefore were disadvantaged as a result. It was necessary therefore to examine the values held by the members of the organization. The research question at this stage focused on performance. It was considered likelt that perceptions around effective performance would reveal some of the values held by members of the organization. Participants were asked to identify colleagues (at the same rank as themselves) whom they had worked with either in the past or were currently working alongside, and consider them in terms of how effectively they performed in their role. In each interview participants were asked to think of two colleagues for each category of good, average or poor, thereby considering the effective or indeed non-effective performance of six colleagues in total. Participants were not requested to reveal the identity of the officers and the issue of gender was only introduced at the very end of the exercise when the researchers enquired if any of the elements selected for the exercise had been female.

The repertory grids elicited a series of constructs which represented the perceptions of those interviewees surrounding the nature of effective performance within County Constabulary. Forty eight grids were completed, the number of constructs for each grid varied according to the interviewee. Overall almost two hundred measures of effective performance were identified.

Questionnaires The information gathered through the repertory grids was used to develop four different questionnaires. These perceptions surrounding effective performance which had been elicited from the grids were presented to four new groups of employees. The questionnaires (600 in total) were distributed to separate divisions in the constabulary. The focus for each questionnaire was different and asked the respondents to consider the items listed and assess whether they were:

1. Likely to facilitate promotion to the next rank
2. Likely to facilitate or inhibit performance in CID
3. Likely to facilitate or inhibit performance in FPU
4. Gendered (female like or male like)

In addition a fifth group received the BEM Sex Role Inventory (Bem, 1974) as a measure of gender self schema.

Interviews Six semi-strucutred open response interviews (King, 1993) were conducted with a sample of female police officers. The purpose of the interviews was to discuss some of the research findings from the repertory grids and the questionnaires in order to gain an employee perspective.

Appraisal Forms Fifty appraisal forms (for both male and female officers) were examined.

Content analysis was used to establish the similarities or differences between the appraisals of male and female officers.

Results

Repertory Grids Content analysis of the grids yielded noticeable similarities between subjects in the use of several constructs. For example; commitment; enthusiasm; reliability. In fact it was these constructs which appeared so consistently that it became apparent that commitment particularly was a key factor in the perception of effective performance. On the whole content analysis did not reveal any significant differences between rank or role or in fact gender.

Questionnaires Analysis of the questionnaire relating to gender indicates some similarities between subjects in terms of those items perceived as male or female. The main discoveries from questionnaires two and three (inhibiting or faciliting performance in either CID or FPU) showed some interesting trends. The main discovery was the emergence of hard evidence that women have to work twice as hard as males in order to be considered effective in their work. The behaviours thought to be necessary for effective performance in CID were numerous, and the behaviours considered to inhibit performance were few, only two in fact. This was reversed when considering performance in the FPU. The results of the fourth questionnaire demonstrated that there was no consensus or agreement from the respondents as to which behaviours would facilitate promotion to the next rank. The resluts from the Bex Sex Role Inventory indicated that the males percieved themselves to be stereotypically male or more androgynous, whereas the females tended to view themselves as stereotypically male.

InterviewsThe interviews revealed that women in the constabulary felt that commitment was indeed a key factor when considering effective performance, but not on the interviewees could identify the behaviours required for promotion.

AppraisalsContent analysis of the appraisal forms showed that male beahviours were described in a variety of ways, whereas female behaviours were described in very narrow terms. The main finding however, is that there were no real differences between performace ratings for males and females.

Conclusions

The similarities between the constructs elicited via the repertory grids suggest the presence of a strong organizational culture which, on closer examination, appears to be exclusionary and male dominated. Perceptions around effective performance produced a high level of agreement among subjects, eg. commitment, enthusiasm. any organization which is able to demonstrate uch consensus among its employees as to what constitutes success must surely possess a powerful culture. Human resource management relies heavily upon the management of the organizational culture in order to successfully implement HR policies and practices. Legge (1989) states that models of HRM emphasise the management of an organization's culture as the central activity for senior management. Therefore the culture within the police service is a secure foundation for the effective management of the employees via the human resource management activities.

The emphasis placed upon employee commitment within the police service reflects the value placed upon employee commitment through models of sophisticated human resource management practice. The ability to secure flexibility and commitment is often considered to be one of the most attractive features of HRM (Storey, 1995; Blyton & Turnbull, 1992; Guest, 1987). From the research it is evident that employee commitment is valued highly in the polie service and the interviews demonstrated that such employee commitment is often synonymous with flexibility and a willingness to work long hours. The existence of a huma resource management culture which relies heavily upon co-operation, commitment and flexibility from its members may unwittingly restrict the activities and behaviours of some of its members. Commitment thus is a feature in the police service in all HR activites such as appraisal, HRD, recruitment and selction, and promotion. The result of course is that whole sectors of the organization are excluded via such a process.

Opportunities for HRD are exclusionary as female officers are not permitted to enter all specialist departments (which is the main arena for HRD). Women are not overtly excluded but the

organizational culture almost renders it impossible for them to be considered for such posts by virtue of their gender and when such unquestioned sexual stereotyping is in place.. If HRD is to be avaialable to all members of the organizaton then the supporting requirements of equity and fairness must be in place in order for development plans and policies to be effective. The appraisal refelcts the equal abilities between male and female officers, yet in practice female officers are not entering a full range of jobs within the police service despite being equipped to do so.

Overall it is the belief of this research that a human resource strategy which advocates an equal opportunities policy on the one hand, yet demands a high level of employee commitment on the other, may in fact contribute to the continuation of an exclusionary culture. The HRD activities of the organization should be accessible to all members but it cannot operate within a culture that excludes some members. Unless some responsibilty is given to HRD for the full development and training of all employees the the HRD strategy will only ever be applicable to a chosen few. If HRD is apprsoched from an employee persepective as well as an organizational persepctive then it may well be in a position to assist the organization in the management of diversity and the achievement of equal opportunties.

References

Bem, S. (1974) The Measurement of Psychological Androgyny Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology 42 (2) 155-162

Blyton, P. and Turnbull, P. (1992) Reassessing Human Resource Management Sage, London.

Dalton, M. (1964) Preconceptions and Methods in Men Who Manage, in Hammond, P. (1964) Sociologists at Work Basic Books

Guest, D. (1987) Human Resource Management and Industrial Relations Journal of Management Studies 24 (5) 503-21

King, N. (1993) The Qualitative Research Interview, in Cassell, C. and Symon, G. (1993) Qualitative Research Methods, Sage, London

Legge, K. (1989) Human Resource Management a critical analysis,in Storey, J. (ed) New Perspectives on Human Resource Management Routledge, London, 19-40

Storey, J. (ed) (1995) Human Resource Management a critical text Routledge, London

Leadership Development in Multiracial Organizations

Larry G. Martin
University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee

Race and ethnicity are often acknowledged by managers and administrators to be important considerations in their efforts to lead multiracial organizations. A multiple perspective approach to the analysis of complex organizational problems involving diversity offers a more effective alternative to leadership than a single leadership perspective. A case analysis approach is used to provide an in-depth analysis of a leader's actions to address diversity problems within a multiracial organization and to identify the extent to which the leader utilized a multiframe approach to leadership.

Multiracial organizations are different from monoracial organizations in the sense that the proportion of race and ethnic minorities is large enough to significantly influence the decisions, practices, policies, and culture of the organization. Race as a social construct is often acknowledged by managers and administrators to be a primary consideration in their efforts to provide leadership to multiracial organizations. However, the theoretical literature on leadership and leadership development has not kept pace with the changing racial demographics of many organizations and the effects these may have on the most appropriate approaches to leadership. As minorities increase their proportional representation in organizations as staff, clients, or leaders/managers there is the potential for increased incidents of race/ethnicity related issues and problems. Race/ethnicity concerns include the following: interpersonal conflict, allegations of racism, law suits alleging racial discrimination, low morale among all employees, high employee turnover among minorities, low rates of professional advancement among minorities, loss of market share for niche markets serving the cultural preferences of minorities, and others.

These concerns can be either avoided or effectively ameliorated via the provision of appropriate leadership. However, "appropriate" leadership is often relative and contingent upon the underlying philosophical assumptions and perspectives of the influential actors within the context of problem situations. A multiple perspective approach to the analysis of complex organizational problems involving diversity offers a more effective alternative to leadership problems and issues than the more traditional practice of adopting a single leadership perspective. This paper draws on Burrell and Morgan's (1979) framework of sociological paradigms to identify the underlying assumptions and beliefs that inform four leadership perspectives: bureaucratic-managerial, symbolic/constructivist, transformational, conflict/political. These perspectives are then applied via a case analysis to a race/ethnicity related leadership problem that occurred within a multiracial organization.

Race and Organizational Leadership

"Race" is the categorization of people based on apparent similarities of physical attributes, e.g., form of hair, color of skin and eyes, stature, bodily proportions, etc. (Goldberg, 1993). Although there are few significant biological differences among people that would warrant differentiation into racial categories, the differential treatment based solely on racial demarcation is endemic to America's socio-cultural fabric and heritage. Several issues and trends suggest that race and ethnicity are pivitol leadership variables for many organizations now and in the future.

First, demographers have determined that modern society is apparently undergoing a historic transition from a predominately White society rooted in Western culture to a global society composed of diverse racial and ethnic minorities (O'Hare, 1993). According to the latest Census Bureau projections, by the 21st century today's racial and ethnic minorities who now comprise about twenty-five percent of the U.S. population will comprise nearly one-half of all Americans. In the next century, African Americans, Asians, and Latinos will outnumber Whites in the U.S. More importantly, the rapid growth in the number of minorities has been marked by an increasing diversity in terms of language differences,

© *copyright 1996, L. Martin*

and cultural beliefs and practices within these population groups as new immigrant groups from the 1980s (such as Vietnamese, Cambodians, Dominicans, and Nicaraguans) have joined earlier immigrant groups of Mexican Americans, Cuban Americans, Chinese Americans, and Japanese (O'Hare, 1993). Also, by 2010, Hispanics are expected to supplant African Americans as the nation's largest minority group. By 2005 the labor force will be comprised of about five percent fewer White males and an equal percentage of more minorities: White males (38%), White females (35%), African-Americans (12%), Hispanics (11%), and Other (4%). Correspondingly, the U.S. labor pool of appropriately skilled workers is expanding at a slower pace than the demand for their labor, thereby creating more intense competition for talent.

Second, the significant increase in the populations of people of color also effects "market place" demands. Although poverty rates for African Americans and Hispanics remain unacceptably high, especially in comparison to the rates of Whites and Asians, the African American and Hispanic middle classes have grown tremendously during the past two decades (Donn, 1992). The Bureau of Labor Statistics reported that in 1989-90 the typical African-American household spent $18,586 (about $172 billion) and Hispanic households spent an average of $23,432 (about $141 billion). When combined with the spending power of Asian Americans, minorities spent about $600 billion in 1992 and they are expected to account for 30 percent of the U.S. economy by the year 2000 (Mc Carroll, 1993).

The increased spending power of minority consumers is radically reshaping the way major corporations view and relate to the "typical" American consumer. The trend is toward "Micromarketing" where corporations seek to target market their products and services to specific market segments and away from "Macromarketing" where consumer preferences have been generalized. In this regard, major corporations (e.g., Pepsico, K-Mart and J.C. Penny and others) have launched strategic efforts (e.g., recruiting minority marketing experts, developing products and services for specific groups, marketing specific products of special interest to particular groups, conducting "ethnic marketing" campaigns, etc.) to attract minority consumers (Mc Carroll, 1993). Nearly half of all Fortune 1000 companies have some sort of ethnic-marketing campaign and in 1992 these companies spent over $500 million on ads and promotions to reach minority consumers. A culturally sensitive, diverse work force enables organizations to better understand and serve these diverse customers: consumers, clients, students, patients, victims, constituents, parishioners, or others.

Third, as a historically racially segregated society, most Americans have not sufficiently developed interpersonal relationship skills to address race/ethnicity problems that are inevitable in integrated organizational settings. For example, several sociological studies during the twentieth century have found that visual differences in physical color are less important than are the differences thought to underlie these colorations e.g., differences in attitudes, beliefs, and social states (Davis and Proctor, 1989). Color and race have had more than any other ascribed status, a preeminent influence on an individual's societal worth. In addition, race or ethnicity brings with it certain expectations, privileges, responsibilities, and limitations. These influence how a person is responded to by and , in turn, perceives the larger society. Studies of race and interpersonal relations have shown that many Whites avoid direct discussion of race, especially with minority individuals, and minimize the salience of race in such relationships (Davis and Proctor, 1989). However, minority individuals view race as critical to their personal and social identities and view the minimization (or denial) of race as problematic. Also, leaders and professional helpers often deny awareness of, or feign blindness to, their followers' (or clients') race, maintaining that they strive to treat minority followers (and clients) like "any other" follower/client (Davis and Proctor, 1989). The problem with this logic is that the "any other" follower/client is usually "White" and provides an inappropriate reference point for dealing with minority follower/clients.

Fourth, more effective leadership is an essential element in the formula for managing multi-racial organizations. Davis and Proctor (1989) investigated the literature on race and group leadership. They found: a) the race of individuals who lead groups is believed to be a critical influence on group processes and outcomes, b) racially heterogeneous groups are believed to be more difficult to lead because they heighten leader tensions and anxieties, and c) racially dissimilar group leaders experience member resistance, tension, hostility, and a general lack of trust from followers, and they are perceived by followers as being more threatening, less positive, and potentially more punitive than same-race group leaders. Effective leadership in multiracial organizations suggests that individuals who have learned to function in diverse situations tend to develop superior cross-cultural communication skills, become better leaders, and develop better skills at giving and receiving feedback. Increasingly, good management is

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

dependant on effectively working with other people by understanding and appreciating differences in values and perspectives as well as simple differences of opinion (Morrison, 1992).

Research Question

One question helped to organize this analysis: to what extent did the administrator/leader in the case utilize multiframe leadership in addressing race-related issues/problems in this multiracial organization?

Methodology

The primary methology informing the development of this theoretical perspective of leadership was a descriptive case study of race/ethnicity problems and issues within a multiracial organization. Due to the author's status as an outsider to the target organization the primary data collection strategy was that of "document examination" (Caudle, 1994). Several document sources were obtained and analyzed: published newspaper accounts, internal memos, internal investigatory reports, and cultural diversity training curricula and participants' packets. The types of data generated from these documents are consistent with goals of the study, i.e., to provide an indepth analysis of an organizational member's actions and the types of policies and guidelines issued by the organization under study (Caudle, 1994).

Conceptual Framework

Several scholars of leadership have advocated the appropriateness of utilizing multiple ontological and epistemological perspectives in reflecting on and analyzing issues of organizational leadership and diversity (Bolman and Deal, 1991; Reitzug, and Cornett, 1991, and others). This approach allows the leader to deepen his/her understanding and sinsitivity to aspects of such issues that might be overlooked when only a single perspective is considered. This multiframe theoretical literature also suggests that leaders/managers often have a dominant perspective from which they view all organizational problems. As organizations experience more race/ethnic diversity, these single-frame perspectives become increasingly problematic as appropriate ways to view organizational issues and problems.

Burell and Morgan (1979) developed a sociological framework that identified four categories of epistemological perspectives that they placed on two axes: objective/subjective, and social regulation/radical change. The resulting prespectives were: structural functionalist, interpretivist, radical structuralist, and radical humanist. These sociological perspectives are manifested in four leadership approaches: bureaucratic-managerial, symbolic/constructivist, transformational, and conflict/poltical.

Structural Functionalism The functionalist paradigm is the dominant framework for the study of organizations. It is chiefly concerned with social regulation and control, i.e., regulating and maintaining the current social order (Burrell and Morgan, 1979). It assumes the social world is composed of relatively concrete empirical artifacts and relationships, and elements of social reality can be identified, studied and measured through objective approaches derived from the natural sciences.

The bureaucratic-managerial model of leadership grows out of the perspectives produced in the functionalist paradigm. The leader's role is to determine how tasks can be accomplished most effectively and efficiently within a social order and structure that is predetermined and inexorable. The practice of leadrship is considered to be value-free and objective. Appropriate leadership can be prescribed via the standardized application of rational, context-free, formally-derived knowledge to a variety of problems and issues (Reitzug, 1994).

Interpretivism The interpretive paradigm views organizations are social constructs. They represent the subjective construction of individual human beings. Through the development and use of common language and the interactions of everyday life, people create and sustain a social world of intersubjectively shared meaning. It attempts to understand the manner in which the organizational world is constructed by the actors involved, i.e., via phenomenological studies. Multiple realities characterize organizations as people attempt to make sense of their situations. It does not seek change, only to understand the basis and source of human reality and consciousness.

The symbolic leadership framework finds its base in the interpretipist paradigm. The symoblic leader views humans as embodied, traditional, historical, and embedded creatures. People are located in a specific history, tradition, and set of circumstances which effect their ways of seeing and options for

acting. This tradition provides meaning and a sense of place. The symbolic leader develops a cogent understanding of the multiple realities and shared meanings present in the organization. Interpretative dialogue such as, the telling and re-telling of narratives and stories of human lives, allows leaders to provide the organization with its history, its unique place in the course of human events, and its significance in the world order. Symbolic leaders strive for insight and understanding of contextually-specific situations with a recognition that multiple contingency solutions exist (Reitzug, 1994).

Radical Humanist The radical humanist paradigm shares with the interpretivists a focus on subjective reality but differs in its focus on radical change. It is committed to a view of society which emphasizes the importance of transcending the limitations of existing social arrangements. Human consciousness is dominated by the ideological superstructures with which they interact, and that these drive a cognitive wedge between people and their true consciousness. This wedge of 'alienation' or 'false consciousness', inhibits or prevents true human fulfilment. Society is anti-human and it is concerned to articulate ways in which human beings can transcend the spiritual bonds and fetters which tie them into existing social patterns and thus realize their full potential.

The transformative leadership framework is most closely affiliated with the radical humanist paradigm. It argues that leaders should engage in dialogue with followers, but from higher levels of morality; in the enmeshing of goals and values both leaders and followers are raised to more principled judgment. It suggests that leaders should engage in critical analysis by reflecting upon institutional arrangements, to reveal the 'taken-for-granted' features of institutional life, and to allow for commentary on the ways and means that the institution either restrains or promotes human agency. Leaders are involved in the creation of new realities and visions. Their role is to convince followers that the current realities are not cast in concrete but can be changed for the better while still providing a sense of meaningfulness.

Radical Structuralist The radical structuralist paradigm seeks radical social change from an objectivist standpoint. It focuses upon structural relationships within a realist social world. Advocates of this perspective argue that radical change is built into the very nature and structure of contemporary society. Contemporary society is characterized by fundamental conflicts which generate radical change through political and economic crises. Human emancipation from the social structures in which they live is brought about through conflict and change.

The leader as politician framework views organizations as political arenas that house a complex variety of individuals and interest groups that must be managed by leaders. Individuals and interest groups differ in their values, preferences, beliefs, information, and perceptions of reality. Such differences are usually enduring and change slowly if at all. It argues that all events are value-laden (Gibson , 1986 in Reitzug, 1994), and organizational decisions involve the exercise of power by one individual or group over another. Policies and practices are frequently taken-for-granted however, they differentially effect various groups (Reitzug, 1994). Organizational goals and decisions emerge from ongoing processes of bargaining, negotiation, and jockeying for position among individuals and groups. Because of scarce resources and enduring differences, power and conflict are central features of organizational life. The leader as politician's goal is to free organizational members from sources of domination, alienation, exploitation, and repression by critiquing the existing social structure with the intent of changing it (Gioia and Pitre, 1990; in Reitzug, 1994).

Case: Racism in the Cream City Police Department

The Setting The Cream City Police Department (CCPD) is located in Cream City, which is a Midwestern city of 630,000 people, 34 percent of whom are minorities. The department's mission is to enhance the quality of life in the city by working cooperatively with the public to enforce the law, preserve the peace, reduce the fear of crime, and provide for a safe environment. The department is organized as a professional bureaucracy. That is, its operating core is very large relative to its other structural parts, there are few levels between the strategic apex and officers; control is provided mainly by the professional indoctrination of their members; and the support staff exists to serve the officers, who carry out the primary responsibilities of the department (Bolman and Deal, 1991). The strategic apex is comprised of the Fire and Police Commission (which is appointed by the mayor and is responsible for hiring officers), the Chief of Police, and district commanders.

During the past three decades, the department has had only three individuals to serve as the

Chief of Police. Author Lewis served in the position for twenty three years before retiring due to illness. An interim Chief served 18 months before a national search resulted in the hiring of David Garcia in 1989. Chief Garcia is officially listed as Hispanic, although he is of Polish/Mexican extraction. He came to Cream City after about ten years of successful service in another Midwestern city. He was attracted to this position because he saw it as an opportunity to put into practice his philosophy of Community Oriented policing, i.e., a policy initiative that broadens the police mandate beyond a narrow focus on fighting crime to include efforts that also address the fear of crime, social and physical disorder and neighborhood decay which are believed to correlate highly with crime. During his first years as Chief he developed an infrastructure for making community policing both a department-wide philosophy and the corporate strategy of the CCPD. For example, in 1991 he received an external grant to fund community conferences to address community policing in Cream City. Four forums were organized and were attended by block watch captains, city counsel members and department heads, Police Department members, and representatives of various community based agencies. However, his efforts to pursue his vision were often frustrated by internal strife born of a history of alleged racism in the department.

When Chief Garcia arrived, he discovered that police hiring was regulated by Federal court decrees from the mid-1970s (e.g., requiring that 2 of every 5 officers hired be a minority). These pacts stemmed from race and sex discrimination lawsuits (many of them were filed by the Minority Officer's League (MOL) to be discussed below) and resulted in agreements to integrate police recruit classes with women and minorities. Prior to the lawsuits, the number of minority officers was kept secret. Chief Lewis disclosed the number in 1973 only after being threatened with the loss of federal anti-crime funds. Among 2,133 officers in the department, 59 were African American, 10 were Hispanic, and 6 were Native American. Minority representation was 3.5 percent at a time when minorities represented 28 percent of the city's population.

After two decades of court mandated hiring, and particularly under the leadership of Chief Garcia, the number of minority offers has significantly increased. In 1992 that number stood at 387 (20.3% of the force): 259 were African American, 100 were Hispanic, 28 were Native American, and 2 were Asian. Chief Garcia has observed in a Cream City newspaper report that the credit for significantly increasing the number of minorities on the force could be attributed to the dedicated efforts of the personnel assigned to the department' s recruiting section. He said, "The goal is for the department to mirror the community we serve. For it is only through a greater representation of all segments of our community that a truly great department will become an even better one."

However, since his arrival, racial and ethnic strife have sharply divided the department along racial lines and significantly reduced the morale of the force. The Minority Officer's League (MOL) was organized when the department was under the stewardship of Chief Lewis. Its goal was to fight discrimination within the department and to seek the hiring and promotion of more minorities. In 1992 its ranks had grown to about 200 African American officers. In 1991, White male officers who were frustrated over departmental hiring and promotional actions involving race, formed an organization: Law Enforcement Officers Concerned About Reverse Discrimination (LEOCARD). The purpose of the group is to assure that the promotional process is fair and consistent, and to the extent possible, ensure the promotions of the best qualified persons regardless of race or gender.

In 1992, a Cream City newspaper mail survey of 1,900 officers (584 of which were returned; 42 were minority) revealed the extent of the polarization around the issue of discrimination and racism in the department. When asked if police officers discriminated against homosexuals, Asians, Blacks, women, Hispanics, or Whites, White officers were nearly unanimous in saying "No." The largest percentage (4%) agreed that discrimination existed against homosexuals. However, from 42 percent to 63 percent of African American officers agreed that the police discriminate against all but one group: White heterosexual men. Only 5 percent agreed that Whites were discriminated against. When asked if they have been a victim of racism themselves, 88 percent of the African American respondents and 77 percent of White officers answered "Yes." In written responses, many officers, both minorities and Whites expressed bitterness about racial tensions within the department. For example, one Hispanic officer responded that "racism" by the so-called superior White man was the thing he disliked most about his job. "I've had people of all colors in my home. Ask any White Sergeant how many Blacks or Hispanic friends they have and also when was the last time a Black man was in his home. Chances are their response would be, 'When my house was burglarized.' These are the typical jokes you hear about minorities." The survey also discovered that about 84 percent of White respondents said their morale was "low" or

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

"somewhat low" compared to 16 percent who rated it as "high" or "somewhat high." About 30 percent of African Americans rated morale as "high " or "somewhat high." It is within this context that Chief Garcia confronted two critical incidents involving race and ethnicity.

Critical Incident 1: The Darwin Cops In the early morning hours of July 22, 1991, a fleeing young African American male caught the attention of two city police officers who returned with him to apartment #213 located in a central city apartment complex. There, they discovered the demonic and grisly activities of serial killer Jim Darwin. Their discovery also led to the revelation of several events that occurred two months earlier on May 27, 1991. On the evening of this date, two White police officers were summoned to a predominately African-American community to help a 14 year old Laotian immigrant. This teenager was eventually killed by Darwin after the officers, responding to a citizen report of "a naked, bleeding boy staggering in the street", returned him to Darwin's apartment. Darwin (a White male) convinced the officers that the youth was a drunken "adult" house-guest who had wandered outside naked. He was Darwin's 13th victim; four more African American men would die before Darwin was arrested two months later.

Most of Darwin's victims were minorities, and three young African American women had made the first "citizen call" to the police department to assist the Laotian immigrant. According to a Police Commission Report of the incident, the efforts of the three women to provide information to the officers that was contrary to Darwin's account were vigorously rebuked. One of the officers agreed to talk to the older African American woman who made the "citizen call", but he did so in an abrasive manner. For example, he told her that he had several years of experience as an investigator and he didn't need an amateur like her trying to tell him his business. She was instructed to leave the immediate area upon threat of being "taken downtown."

A Fire Department medical unit arrived, but it was sent away without having assisted the Laotian youth. The Officers visited Darwin's apartment, where Darwin produced the Laotian youth's clothing and Polaroid photos of the youth posing in bikini underwear. While there they observed "a neat and clean apartment", however, they also noticed "a noxious odor." The body of Darwin's 12th victim was decaying in the bedroom.

Although they left the scene as ordered, two of the women who initially made the "citizen call" made several follow-up telephone calls to the police station to inquire about the well-being of the Laotian youth. They were repeatedly told that he was an adult, and that he was safe.

The revelation of these events embroiled the city in controversy. It pitted the police against the city's African-American community and severely divided the police department along racial lines. In this community racked by crime several citizens attempted to be responsible and assist the police in an investigation. However, they encountered from the police behavior that was threatening, abrasive, and patronizing.

During an inquiry into the incident by the Fire and Police Commission the officers argued that a history of mistrust between the Police Department and the community was a factor in accepting Darwin's story about a homosexual relationship with the Laotian youth. They were showing sensitivity to alternative lifestyles. They also pointed out that Darwin was 'a slick con artist.' However, the FPC rejected these explanations and found that the officers failed to conduct a proper investigation in 15 respects. The officers were suspended without pay and subsequently fired.

Concerned about the image of the police in the minority community, Chief Garcia ordered an internal investigation into race-related issues in the police department. The panel submitted its findings one month after the Darwin murders. The panel recommended several changes to improve the department's relationship to its service community, e.g., creating a community oriented policing advisory committee, recruiting more Asians and other minorities, and reviewing and revising the department's complaint procedure. However, one of their primary recommendations was to implement department-wide diversity training. In December of 1991, a consulting firm was hired and Cultural Awareness training was provided to all employees.

Incident 2: Minority Officer's League Alleges Racial and Gender Discrimination In October, Chief Garcia received written complaints from 28 minority officers from two district stations alleging racial and gender discrimination by their supervisors and calling for an independent study of racism in the CCPD. A newspaper article stated that the officers complained of being treated unfairly, of being disciplined more often and more severely than White officers, and being subjected to racially insensitive remarks by their supervisors. The leader of the MOL stated that stronger and clearer

guidelines were needed within the police officers' contracts to ensure their emotional and physical safety against discrimination. As an example, he cited a case in which the department may endanger the physical well being of some African American officers. He indicated one African American probationary officer was recently sent to a "gang infested area" on a call whereas in another case three White police officers were sent to the same area to ensure their safety. He said that the message to minorities was "you're expendable."

In response to these complaints the Chief of Police impaneled a Board of Inquiry to investigate racial and gender concerns. The Board sought face-to-face meetings with officers throughout the CCPD. In November, it met with two groups of complainants and their commanding officers. In addition, meetings were held with two groups of other officers who cooperated with the investigation. However, at three other scheduled meetings, the officers refused input and left the meetings when they were told that audio taping would no longer be permitted due to confidentiality concerns. In December, 21 officers from the MOL notified the Chair of the Board that the Board had not been responsive to their needs. The signatories were then ordered to meet before the Board to hear how the investigation would proceed. Later during this month, the MOL notified the Chief that the Board was not a creditable effort to make needed changes within the CCPD. Two days later, the Cream City Police Association (i.e., the Police Union) filed for (and received) a temporary injunction restraining the department from requiring officers to appear before the Board. The Chair of the Board and Chief Garcia met to identify an alternative strategy.

In January, 1993 officers throughout the department were notified of a requirement to submit Matter Of reports to the Board (as opposed to in-person tape recorded sessions). Several grievances were filed pertaining to this strategy, however, the written documents were submitted by all officers. In February, the Board met to review the Matter Of documents. Also, several reports were filed by minority officers alleging retaliation against them by supervisors. In March the Board requested a list of documentation from various departments within the CCPD. In April, the Board reviewed the final draft of recommendations. Seven months later, i.e., in November, Chief Garcia approved and authorized implementation of the recommendations. In December, the original 28 signatories were provided a summary of the Board's work and individual letters of response from Chief Garcia.

The recommendations targeted Five categories of organizational behavior: assignments, discipline, ethnic/gender sensitivity, supervision, and training. Multiple structural changes were recommended under each category of organizational behavior. Among those recommended for "ethnic/gender sensitivity" were the following: a) annual, on-going diversity training to open dialogue between all members of the department, b) enhanced exit interview process to determine why members leave, additional criteria on the performance evaluation form to assess employee's skills and abilities to relate to a diverse work force and community, and others.

Discussion

During the first incident involving two White officers who responded inappropriately to a citizen's call for assistance it could be argued that Chief Garcia responded largely from an interpretivist/symbolic frame of reference. For example, he did commission a panel to "investigate" the charges of racism in the department which symbolically represents to the community that he is concerned. He also supported the firing of the White officers which politically and symbolically aligned him with the minority community and African American officers in opposition to many in the White community and the position of the Cream City Police Union. However, given the limited scope of the panel's investigation and the minimum changes it proposed, I believe the actions of Chief Garcia more strongly support a functionalist/ bureaucratic-managerial model of leadership to address the issue.

The epistemological assumptions of administrators are a key element of their orientation to leadership and have implications for both decision making and the ethical use of power (Reitzug, 1994). In order for Chief Garcia to support the suspension and eventual firing of the officers and to implement the small number of changes proposed by the internal investigatory panel, he must believe that : a) organizational problems can be addressed objectively and matched with the corresponding best solutions. The extent to which the department experienced racism could be remedied via the addition of more minority officers, particularly Asian officers, a few structural changes, and mandatory diversity training; b) clearly specifiable behaviors exist that are generalizable to police work within any context. The hearing

by the Fire and Police Commission identified specific infractions of department rules and procedures and these were seen as justification for the dismissal of the officers; and c) organizational sanctions should be applied equally to those who violate the rules. In this respect the race of the officers did not matter. They utilized sloppy police procedures and their inadequate performance caused a serial killer to kill again.

The inappropriateness of this single-frame perspective was evidenced in the fact that the second critical incident occurred and again embroiled the department in controversy. In his response to the MOL's charges of racism within the department, Chief Garcia demonstrated elements of a multiframe approach to address the issue. First, from a functionalist perspective he recognized and used the chain of command structure to communicate with all the parties involved; utilized his authority to "order" the partitioning officers to "hear" how their concerns will be addressed; and he utilized his authority to "order" all officers to submit "Matter Of" reports to the Board of Inquiry. Second, from an interpretivist/symbolic perspective he commissioned a Board of Inquiry and gave it authority to probe deeply into the department's practices by gathering both quantitative and qualitative evidence of racism; by talking directly to the officers, both minority and White, and those at different levels of the department the Board could gain a more subjective view of the department's operations. Third, the board's recommendations suggested a need for both a paradigm shift in both how officers "think" about and perceive each other (i.e., the radical humanist perspective is evident in the Chief's support of long-term diversity training and other training initiatives) and the structures that govern the use of power in the department (i.e., the radical structuralist perspective is evident in the radical changes proposed in existing practice and may help to alleviate some concerns of minorities in the department).

Overall, Chief Garcia's leadership focused on the elimination of inequitable effects that might result from organizational practices and policies that have traditionally reflected the culture, mores, and needs of the dominant class (i.e., White, male officers). By following the Board's recommendations, it could be argued that Chief Garcia utilized elements of each of the paradigms to structure his response. However, there was little emphasis on dialogue and premise testing to identify the meaning perspectives of all officers. For example, the Matter Of reports submitted by all officers provided a one-way flow of information and the readers had no means to test their interpretations against the intentions of the authors. Therefore, in an organization severely divided along race/ethnic lines, more effective leadership would focus on the needs and interests of "all" parties, to hear their voices and to communicate and advocate one's views.

References

Bolman, L.G. and Deal, T.E. (1991). *Reframing organizations: Artistry, choice, and leadership*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.

Burrell, G. and Morgan, G. (1979). *Sociological paradigms and organizational analysis: Elements of the sociology of corporate life*. London: Heineman LTD.

Caudle, S.L. (1994). Using qualitative approaches. (In Wholey, J.S.; Hatry, H.P.; and Newcomer, K.E. (Eds.)). *Handbook of practical program evaluation*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass, pp. 69-95.

Davis, L.E. and Proctor, E.K. (1989). *Race, gender, and class: Guidelines for practice with individuals, families, and groups*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentince Hall.

Donn, W. (1992). The move toward ethnic marketing. *Nation's Business*, 80 (7), 39.

Goldberg, D.T (1993). Racist culture: Philosophy and the politics of meaning. Cambridge, MA: Blackwell Publishers.

McCarroll, T. (1993). Its a mass market no more: Ethnic Marketing. *Time (Special Issue: The New face of America)*, 142 (21), 80.

Morrison, A.M. (1992). *The new leaders: Guidelines on leadership diversity in America*. San Francisco, Jossey-Bass.

O'Hare, W.P. (1993). Diversity trend: More minorities looking less alike. *Population Today*, 21 (4), p. 1-2.

Reitzug, U.C. (1994). Diversity, power and influence: Multiple perspectives on the ethnics of school leadership. *Journal of School Leadership*, 4, pp. 197-222.

HRD Initiatives Contributing to Women's Career Progress

Kimberly S. McDonald
Indiana-Purdue University Fort Wayne

Linda M. Hite
Indiana-Purdue University Fort Wayne

Despite progress in the number of women in management, very few are obtaining upper echelon positions. Recent literature suggests that one factor influencing gender differences in organizational advancement is opportunity for management development. This paper will present the findings of an exploratory study examining factors that influence women's access to management development and revisit how four major HRD initiatives may assist women's advancement.

Women have been entering the ranks of management in increasing numbers for the past 20 years. However, while women hold approximately 42% of management positions, they make up only 5% of top level staff (Powell, 1993). While this phenomenon has received press attention and has been acknowledged by Congress through the enactment of the Glass Ceiling Act of 1991, this skewed representation persists. Although some may argue that women's advancement is no longer a significant issue, companies choosing not to address this issue risk losing valuable resources (Antal & Izraeli, 1993).

A review of recent literature suggests that a major factor influencing the gender differences in organizational advancement is opportunity for management development (Ohlott, Ruderman, & McCauley, 1994; Tharenou, Latimer, & Conroy, 1994; Van Velsor & Hughes, 1990). If gender differences in management development are contributing to sustaining the glass ceiling, HRD is well positioned to play an important role in rectifying the situation. Several HRD initiatives have the potential to assist women in developing the credentials to be promoted to high-ranking positions in organizations. This paper will review the literature focusing on gender differences in management development, present the finding of an exploratory study conducted on factors expediting and impeding women's access to management development, and suggest four initiatives HRD units can develop to enhance women's management development opportunities and hence, their potential for career advancement.

Statement of Problem and Theoretical Framework

The literature to date indicates that women and men receive different developmental experiences during their careers (Ohlott, Ruderman, & McCauley, 1994). Women have reported having fewer opportunities to experience certain types of assignments than men (Van Velsor & Hughes, 1990). Ohlott et al. (1994) found subtle forms of discrimination that perpetuate the glass ceiling. For example, women held positions and took on assignments that were less visible within organizations and that involved less risk and less breadth of responsibility than men. Ohlott et al. (1994) write of the dilemma this creates:

> Denying women access to high-level responsibilities creates a vicious cycle in the selection and development process. If women do not have access to these challenges, they may be perceived as less qualified than men and may then be unable to qualify for the next job. If a women's career is later accelerated for affirmative action reasons, the organization may be setting her up for failure because she lacks these experiences (p. 62).

In a study analyzing promotion decisions made by a Fortune 500 company, differences were found in the reasons provided for promoting men and women (Ruderman, Ohlott, & Kram, 1995). Men

©*copyright, McDonald & Hite, 1996*

were more likely to be promoted because they were "known quantities" to their bosses, they were perceived as being credible to upper management. Managers appeared to be more hesitant to advance women, asking them to prove themselves extensively before promoting them. Having the women "prove themselves" before promotion supposedly reduced the perceived risk taken by the manager. Ruderman et al. (1995) concluded that:

> . . . hiring managers still were not adept at using promotions as a means of giving women challenge and recognition. Bosses tended to have a difficult time determining how much risk to take when making assignment decisions for women subordinates, and it appears that the risk was perceived as greater with women, because bosses wereless comfortable with these candidates.

Training opportunities also may influence women's advancement in organizations. A study examining determinants of managerial advancement found that training, which men received more frequently than females, led to promotions (Tharenou, Latimer, & Conroy, 1994). Work experience had an indirect effect on advancement, in that work experience influenced the amount of training one received (the more work experience accumulated, the more training received). Having spouses and/or dependents at home reduced women's work experience base and increased men's. This phenomenon then influenced the amount of training men and women received (with men receiving more) and hence, their advancement opportunities. However, career encouragement increased women's training and development participation.

Developing mentor relationships is another important developmental activity for men and women wishing to progress in their careers. There has been a significant amount of literature produced on the importance of these relationships, particularly regarding women's advancement and the problems associated with obtaining mentors. Noe (1988) for example, outlined six potential barriers to women's access to mentors, including: lack of access to information networks, tokenism, stereotypes and attributions, socialization practices, norms regarding cross-sex relationships, and reliance on ineffective power bases. Parker and Kram (1993) discussed the potential barriers to women gaining access to other women as mentors. For example, since female mentoring relationships are more rare, they are highly visible in the organization. This visibility presents a risk for the mentor, if the protege were to fail. Also, women in upper management may be too pre-occupied with their own battles to break the class ceiling to have time to mentor other women. However, recent literature suggests that mentoring relationships are becoming more attainable for women. As an example, Ragins & Scandura (1994) found that executive women were as likely as executive men to be mentors. Numerous companies have implemented formal mentoring programs to eliminate many of the barriers women and minorities have experienced in gaining access to mentors informally.

Another developmental activity that impacts promotion opportunities, is overseas experience. Women are less likely to receive overseas assignments, which increasingly is becoming an important developmental activity given our global economy. Antal & Izraeli (1993) provide various reasons why there are few U.S. women expatriates. Included in their rationale are: women perceive less opportunity for receiving overseas assignments, so do not pursue getting them; expatriates usually are middle or senior level managers; it is assumed that women will not be treated kindly or credibly by certain cultures; and prejudiced attitudes exist within their own companies that impede women from being selected for overseas assignments.

While these studies suggest that the lack of management development experiences influence women's advancement they do not examine the specific factors that may influence women's participation in management development. Tharenou et al.'s (1994) study provides some guidance regarding what factors increase and decrease training and development opportunities for women. Blais, Duquette, & Painchaud (1989) determined that incidental costs (i.e., child care costs, loss of income) and conflicting role demands were the most salient barriers to participating in continuing education for nurses. However, a systematic examination of both facilitators and deterrents to participation in management development activities is needed to assist HRD in determining what initiatives are needed to assist women's career progress.

as a supervisor, there are a lot of jobs that other people don't want to do, so they kinda give them to you. So if you take them and then turn them into something more than what they expected, then that a lot of times gives you some credibility behind you, and then you start getting offered other things." Another women recounted her experience in becoming a manager. She was put in charge of a "loss program and turned it into a profit program." She concluded that "I had to prove that a woman could do it before I could really get the title. They (management) were very reluctant to put a woman in charge of a program."

Factors Facilitating Participation: One of the major factors facilitating participation in management development was the female managers' personal initiative -- being persistent, asking for opportunities, and being willing to take on additional responsibilities as a means of proving themselves. One female manager asserted: "Ourselves, our capabilities, our willingness, drive, I mean that's really what it comes down to." Other comments such as: "You have to create your own visibility," and "You can't just sit back and wait for someone to hand it to you," were indicative of this theme as expressed throughout the four group discussions.

Building relationships, networking, and developing connections with upper management were other factors that assisted some women in obtaining access to management development activities. For some, supportive bosses encouraged the pursuit of opportunities. Another found it helpful to have worked with several of the executives in her company prior to her employment when they were all part of the same community agency project.

Two women cited the value of support systems to help with child care when they were pursuing management development opportunities. One manager stated: ". . .I have a househusband more or less, so if I say 'I have a chance to go to Denver next week spontaneously, so you've got the kids.' I can do that a lot more easily than other people can, and a big part of my career decision to stay (here) was that I do have my extended family here, so in terms of back-up child care and all those other kinds of issues, I have that system in place." Another factor facilitating participation for some women was the availability of company programs/policies that supported professional development. Specific programs mentioned included: tuition reimbursement, management training programs, and job posting. Two of the groups cited company awareness of the need for greater diversity as a motivator to include women on committees and projects. Consequently, more opportunities emerged with the acknowledgment of the necessity for greater representation.

Factors Hindering Participation: Family responsibilities were frequently mentioned by managers as a deterrent to participating in management development activities. The discussants provided examples from their personal experiences and from those of their colleagues to suggest that women's responsibilities at home often preclude them from participating in management development and at the very least, make it difficult for them to do so. This theme was summed up by the following remark: "In looking at what are some of the difficulties in fulfilling the expectations that you have on the job, or things that you'd like to do yourself, family responsibilities really get in the way; I think much differently for women than for men." While some cited society's expectations as a major reason for this inequity regarding family responsibility, others indicated they wanted to spend time with children and family, and therefore self-selected out of developmental opportunities for this reason.

For the women in the manufacturing firm, the corporate culture was the greatest deterrent to participating in management development. They stated that the "male-dominated, military type" culture was less open to women's advancement and opportunities for development would be rare were it not for affirmative action initiatives. However, these women suggested that once they obtained opportunities to lead and had proven themselves, they were supported by their male peers and bosses.

Other factors hindering these managers' participation in management development were lack of resources (i.e., time and money), their positions within the organization, and their bosses. Some women expressed concerns about requesting funds for management development activities when budgets were tight and others in their departments needed money for projects as well. They also noted time to pursue activities was short when compared to work loads and home responsibilities. For a few, not working in a line position or in a department considered to be "important" to the company was problematic: ". . . Working in a support area means that you get overlooked for some development opportunities, because they feel that it doesn't apply." And just as some women perceived their bosses as supporters of their management development, others indicated their bosses did not support these efforts.

Gender Influence: The final question posed to the respondents asked if they perceived that

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

gender influences opportunities to participate in management development. With the exception of one participant, the focus group discussants believed that gender does influence access to management development activities. The issues of the "good old boy" network and the tendency on the part of the typically white male senior staff to groom those most like themselves were discussed frequently in the four focus groups. While several indicated it is getting easier for women to obtain opportunities, they still perceive upper management is not completely comfortable selecting and coaching women as candidates for advancement. This concern was exemplified by one women manager who stated: "Clearly the majority of senior managers have still been white men, and many of them have not had diverse experience with others who are not like them. . . they're comfortable with people who are like them and they know more people who are like them."

The participants emphasized the need to both be assertive and to do excellent work to gain access to management development activities. A major theme emerging from the data was the perception that performance expectations are greater for women than for men. Comments such as: "I just feel like I have to work triple hard," "The performance level of the men can be mediocre and it's ok, but mediocre for the women is deadly; and "I do think that there's two sets of standards" (for males and females) were prevalent during the discussion of this question. Many of the women felt they were scrutinized more than their male counterparts and therefore needed to excel to prove themselves worthy of opportunities and advancement.

HRD Initiatives

The nature of the human resource development function to maximize the potential of all employees while contributing to the overall strength of the organization leads naturally to it's involvement in women's career progress and in efforts to dismantle the glass ceiling. Further, programs that can have significant impact on career opportunities historically disseminate from HRD. Four HRD initiatives with the potential to enhance women's management development are: training, career development, mentoring, and succession planning.

Training: Management training opportunities have been demonstrated both in this study and others (i.e., Tharenou, et al., 1994) to be important in facilitating career advancement. HRD can assist women's representation in training programs by : 1. Making programs available to many levels of employees, 2. Examining their training rosters to determine if females are under represented in certain types of training programs, and 3. Offering training at times and locations that are convenient to many. Family responsibilities were cited in the focus group discussions as the greatest barrier to women's participation in management development activities. Organizations committed to diversifying their managerial ranks can set training hours, days and locations to minimize time away from family and offer compensation time for participants when seminars, conferences, and meetings require extensive time after hours.

Women managers' training needs will vary depending on the organization and should be determined through front end assessments. However, some of the gender research provides guidance regarding training needs. For example, Larwood & Wood (1995) updating a study they conducted in 1978, found women executives wanting additional training in communication and networking, and power and politics. These two issues were cited more frequently in the 1995 study than the 1978 research. Training programs that include discussions of these topics and explore some of the potential gender issues surrounding them may assist women and men in understanding each other and identify institutional biases in the corporate culture. Larwood & Wood (1995) also found women executives wanted training that led to the development of skills and functional knowledge. However, no specific skills and knowledge areas were consistently mentioned.

Should HRD create special training programs geared just for women? This issue has been debated for several years in the literature (see for instance, Lewis & Fagenson, 1995; Lam, 1990). The benefits of mixed-sex management programs typically outweigh the benefits of single-sex programs. Segregating the sexes may result in women feeling more isolated in the organization and invite suggestions that women are deficient in specific areas (unlike their male colleagues).
Lewis & Fagenson (1995) suggest that while there may be specific incidences where single-sex programs are appropriate, "'brown-bag' discussion groups and support networks should be considered as valuable

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

alternatives" (p.43). This suggestion may be particularly useful in organizations that are typically male-dominated. For example, in this study, the women from the manufacturing firm commented on how refreshing it was to spend time with their female colleagues and how they wished they could get together more frequently. The women at the authors' university have established a women's network that meets periodically to network and provide valuable career development information. HRD is well positioned to establish these types of support mechanisms.

Career Development: Career development combines individual interests with organizational goals to maximize need fulfillment for both parties. The career development process requires early discussion regarding individual career goals and recognition of the criteria for successful advancement within the organization. Preparation for the highest level positions requires both breadth and depth of background. At one level, this means that women, who frequently begin their employment in staff positions, need to obtain line experience.

Accomplishing this transition may take concerted effort, and HRD can assist in this endeavor both by influencing staffing policies and by encouraging women to move into line positions early in their careers. Specific mechanisms include implementation of a job rotation program, available to men and women who have expressed interest in professional development. Such a program increases the likelihood that women will benefit from this process instead of leaving access to such opportunities to chance or to favoritism. Another area of HRD influence is selection for expatriate opportunities. When relegated to informal networks, women typically do not receive equal consideration. Yet, in the global marketplace, international experience will increasingly become part of the criteria for organizational advancement, putting women at a disadvantage if they are not considered for overseas duty. Preparation of expatriates is another area where HRD can help debunk some myths about the effectiveness of women in overseas positions.

Additional staffing related options were recommended by women in our focus groups. They advised women interested in advancement to take on jobs that others do not want and ask to fill in when a boss is away. They also noted that persistence in requesting such opportunities and hard work once these chances are granted are essential in this process. An example:

> The good old boy network still exists...and they're making certain people slotted for certain positions and unless you let it be known that you would like to go into that position, no one ever really thinks that you would want to do that or that you really can...unless you actually assert yourself and be rather persistent, you have to be real persistent.

Further, they encouraged volunteering for positions that offer visibility to those at higher levels within the organization or an opportunity to work with these individuals. The group members stressed that these may be special small group projects or politically powerful committees. HRD's contribution here can be through monitoring project and committee membership and urging reconsideration of policies and procedures that create biases in selection.

Mentoring: Mentoring programs are another HRD career development initiative that can assist women's organizational progress. Offering potential insight into the culture and politics of the organization, experience within the system, and the opportunity for individual advice and encouragement, a mentoring relationship can be a significant contributor to career success (Lewis & Fagenson, 1995, Cox, 1993). While both informal and formal mentoring processes can yield positive results, the propensity for potential mentors within an informal framework to choose people like themselves as proteges can create a barrier for women, since most of the mentors in positions of power are male (Cox, 1993). A focus group member cited this situation, noting "I've seen it happen with other males in my area, where a person will single somebody out and help them along and stuff, but usually man to man. They're much more comfortable with that...." Consequently, despite some limitations, formal programs are perceived as giving women more equitable access to mentors (Lewis & Fagenson, 1995, Ruderman, Ohlott & Kram, 1995). Formal mentoring programs also are less likely to overburden the few prospective female mentors available, who might otherwise attempt to take on too many proteges.

HRD is the natural focal point for creation of a formal mentoring program. In addition to providing women with access to influential members of the organization through their mentoring relationships, such a program also offers the potential of greater visibility. Concerns over favoritism in assignments or the limited availability of mentors may warrant implementation of mentoring teams or

circles (Lewis & Fagenson, 1995). One mentor may have four or five proteges with whom s/he interacts as a team; or two or more mentors may share six or more proteges.

Succession Planning: Succession planning offers another means for HRD to impact opportunities for women within the organization. Although more long term in focus than other career development initiatives, the process of identification of potential candidates and grooming those individuals begins early, and significantly impacts career choices. Left to informal means, succession plans often reflect gender bias rooted in precedent, stereotypes, and social networks. While women are gaining acceptance at lower managerial levels within organizations, access to the highest ranks remains severely limited. A focus group member described the scenario this way:

> Women aren't taken seriously enough, in that you can be on all these different projects, you can show that you've been able to do all these things, but when push comes to shove, and they're looking at who to promote or whatever, it's as if, even though you did those things, it doesn't have as much credibility as a man...

HRD intervention into succession should focus on objectifying the process. Nowak (1994) outlines a system that begins with analyzing performance competencies required for top management, as opposed to basing criteria on the skills and styles of predecessors. The use of gender balanced panels to identify high potential individuals, instead of relying on the current senior (likely predominantly male) staff is another means of equalizing opportunities. These fundamental changes would broaden the scope of the process and minimize bias in candidate selection.

Global competition means that organizations that want to be successful in the future will need to maximize the potential of all of their employees. The HRD function is in the best position to respond to this need. Programs that promote the professional development of women, who represent half of the workforce, have the potential to make a large impact on how well companies are prepared to meet the challenges of the next decade and beyond.

References

Antal, A.B. & Izraeli, D.N. (1993). A global comparison of women in management: Women managers in their homelands and as expatriates. In E.A. Fagenson (Ed.), Women in management (pp. 52-96). Newbury Park: Sage Publications.

Blais, J., Duquette, A. & Painchaud, G. (1989). Deterrents to women's participation in work-related educational activities. Adult Education Quarterly, 39(4), 224-234.

Cox, T., Jr. (1993). Cultural diversity in organizations. San Francisco: Berrett-Koehler Publishers.

Krueger, R.A. (1994). Focus groups: A practical guide for applied research. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Lam, M.N. (1990, Apr./May). Management training for women: International experiences and lessons for Canada. Journal of Business Ethics, 9, 385-406.

Larwood, L. & Wood, M. M. (1995). Training women for management: Changing priorities. The Journal of Management Development, 14(2), 54-64.

Lewis, A.E. & Fagenson, E. A. (1995). Strategies for developing women managers: How well do the fulfil their objectives? The Journal of Management Development, 14(2), 39-53.

Lederman, L.C. (1990, April). Assessing educational effectiveness: The focus group interview as a technique for data collection. Communication Education, 38, 117-127.

Noe, R.A. (1988). Women and mentoring: A review and research agenda. Academy of Management Review, 13(1), 65-78.

Ohlott, P.J.; Ruderman, M.N.; & McCauley, C.D. (1994). Gender differences in managers' developmental job experiences. The Academy of Management Journal, 37(1), 46-67.

Parker, V.A. & Kram, K.E. (1993). Women mentoring women: Creating conditions for connections. Business Horizons, 36(2), 42-51.

Powell, G.N. (1993). Women and men in management, 2nd ed., Newbury Park, CA: Sage Publications.

Ragins, B.R. & Scandura, T.A. (1994). Gender differences in expected outcomes of mentoring relationships. The Academy of Management Journal, 37(4), 957-971.

Ragins, B.R. & Sundstrom, E. (1989). Gender and power in organizations: A longitudinal perspective. Psychological Bulletin, 105(1), 51-88.

Rothwell, W.J. & Kazanas, H.C. (1993). The complete AMA guide to management development. New York: AMACOM

Ruderman, M.N.; Ohlott, P.J.; & Kram, K.E. (1995). Promotion decisions as a diversity practice, The Journal of Management Development, 14(2), 6-23 .

Tharenou, P., Latimer, S. & Conroy, D. (1994). How do you make it to the top? An examination of influences on women's and men's managerial advancement. The Academy of Management Journal, 37(4), 899-931.

Van Velsor, E. & Hughes, M.W. (1990). Gender differences in the development of managers: How women managers learn from experience. Greensboro, NC: Center for Creative Leadership.